Theory and History of Ontology (www.ontology.co) by Raul Corazzon | e-mail: rc@ontology.co

Annotated bibliography on the Philosophical Work of Eriugena (Second Part: Mai - McG)

**Contents of this Section** 

Eriugena and the Neoplatonic Metaphysics in the Early Middle Ages

This part of the section History of Ontology includes the following pages:

Eriugena: Dialectic and Ontology in the *Periphyseon* 

The Works of Eriugena: Editions and translations

## Bibliography on the Philosophical Work of Eriugena:

Eriugena A - Mad

Eriugena Mai - McG (Current page)

Eriugena McK - Z

The section History of the Doctrine of Categories include the following page:

Eriugena, *Periphyseon* Book I: Aristotelian Logic and Categories

Index of the Pages on Medieval Philosophy

## **Bibliography**

The publications by É. Jeauneau on Eriugena are cited in a separate page: Édouard Jeauneau sur la Philosophie Médiévale. Bibliographie Choisie.

N.B. Summaries cited from: Mary Brennan, A Guide to Eriugenian Studies. A Survey of Publications 1930-1987, are indicated with: (Brennan) and page number.

- 1. Mainoldi, Ernesto Sergio. 2004. "Le fonti del *De praedestinatione liber* di Giovanni Scoto Eriugena." *Studi Medievali* no. 45:651-697.
- 2. . 2005. "Iohannes Scottus Eriugena." In *La trasmissione dei testi latini del medioevo / Mediaeval Latin Texts and their Transmission*, edited by Chiesa, Paolo

and Castaldi, Lucia, 186-264. Firenze: SISMEL - Edizioni del Galluzzo. Le opere e la loro trasmissione, la tradizione manoscritta e le edizioni. Indice: I. Opere speculative (teologico-filosofiche)

1. De praedestiatione liber; 2, Periphyseon;

- II. Opere esegetiche e didattiche
- 3. In Priscianum; 4. Annotationes in Martianum; 5. Glosae Martiani; 6. Glosae diuinae historiae; 7. Tractatus in Mattheum; 8. Expositiones in Ierarchiam coelestem; 9. Omelia "Vox spiritualis aquilae"; 10. Commentarius in Iohannem;
- III. Opera poetica
- 11. Carmina
- IV. Versioni da greco
- 12. Versio operum sancti Dionysii Areopagitae; 13. Versio sancti Gregorii Nisseni Sermones de imagine; 14. Versio sancti Maximi Confessoris Ambiguorum ad Iohannem; 15. Versio sancti Maximi Confessoris Quaestionum ad Thalassum; V. Epistolae
- 16. Epistola "Domine Uniniberte..."

Dubia

- A. Versio Prisciani Lydii Solutiones ad Chosroem regem
- B. Defloratio de libro Ambrosii Macrobii Theodosii De differentis et societatibus graeci latinique uerbi

Appendice: gli autografi eriugeniani.

- 3. ——. 2011. "Vox, sensus, intellectus chez Jean Scot Érigène. Pour une focalisation des sources possibles du débat theologico-grammatical au XIe siècle." In *Arts du langage et théologie aux confins des XIe-XIIe sècles. Textes, Maîtres, Débats*, edited by Rosier-Catach, Irène, 565-582. Turnhout: Brepols.
- 4. ——. 2014. "Creation in Wisdom: Eriugena's Sophiology beyond Ontology and Meontology." In *Eriugena and Creation. Proceedings of the Eleventh International Conference on Eriugenian Studies, held in honor of Edouard Jeauneau, Chicago, November 9-12, 2011*, edited by Otten, Willemien and Allen, Michael I., 183-222. Turnhout: Brepols.
- Dillon, John. 1992. "The Roots of Reason in John Scottus Eriugena." *Philosophical Studies (Dublin)* no. 33:25-38.
   Reprinted as Essay XXIII in: J. M. Dillon, *The Great Tradition. Further Studies in the Development of Platonism and Early Christianity*, Aldershot: Ashgate, 1997.
- 6. Dionisotti, Anna Carlotta. 1988. "Greek Grammars and Dictionaries in Carolingian Europe." In *The Sacred Nectar of the Greeks: The Study of Greek in the West in the Early Middle Ages*, edited by Herren, Michael W. and Brown, Ann Shirley, 1-56. London: King's College.
  - "What this essay tries to offer you is not really an argument or thesis, but rather a map.(1) A somewhat primitive, medieval map to be sure, uncertain in scale and contour, and with large areas of "Here Be Dragons." But it seems worth trying, because Greek grammars and dictionaries are not easy to find one's way around; yet for any Westerner they were potentially the best means of getting, and using, a knowledge of Greek. Potentially, because much of course depends on what sort of grammar, what sort of dictionary." (p. 1)

"Macrobius wrote his work [\*] for a Western audience; so it gives quite a full account of the morphology of the Greek verb, how to distinguish its conjugations, moods and tenses, based on native Greek analysis. Unfortunately it was not written as a didactic handbook, but rather as a learned comparative discussion, aimed at cultured aristocrats like the characters in his own Saturnalia. The Greek content is in fact pretty basic, a symptom of the times, but the manner is discursive; he gives no paradigms, and indeed wholly omits aspects which are not common to the two languages, like the dual and, more seriously, the aorist. Nonetheless it would be of great value to anyone prepared to work through it.

- One such was a certain Johannes, surely John the Scot, to whom indeed we owe most of our knowledge of the work. A single manuscript (J) preserves his *defloratio* of the text all the parts, he explains in a colophon, relevant to Greek. There is then a paradigm of  $\Pi$ OI $\Psi$ , followed by a brief introduction, saying that, besides the *defloratio*, he thought it would be useful to make a summary of the work, organized by lugations rather than by moods and tenses as in Macrobius. This was a very intelligent idea. Unfortunately, the summary breaks off near the beginning; either John left it unfinished or the scribe gave up." (pp. 20-21)
- (1) I use abbreviations for the three works that are essential to this map: CGL = G.Goetz (ed.), *Corpus Glossariorum Latinorum* 1-7 (Leipzig, 1688-1923); GL = H.Keil (ed.), *Grammatici Latini* 1-8 (Leipzig, 1855-1880): in each case I give volume, page, +/- line; and Bischoff, "Das griechische Element" (+ page) = B. Bischoff "Das griechische Element in der abendländischen Bildung des Mittelalters," in his *Mittelalterliche Studien* 2 (Stuttgart, 1967), 246-275. [\*] GL 5:595-655; Cf.Dionisotti, "Latin Grammar for Greeks and Goths," *Journal of Roman Studies* 74 (1984), 206-207.
- 7. Dräseke, Johannes. 1902. *Johannes Scotus Erigena und dessen Gewahrsmanner in seinem Werke De divisione naturae, libri V.* Leipzig: Dieterich. Nachdruck: Aalen: Scientia Verlag, 1972.
- 8. Dronke, Peter. 1990. "Eriugena Earthly Paradise." In *Begriff und Metapher. Sprachform des denkens bei Eriugena*, edited by Beierwaltes, Werner, 213-229. Heidelberg: Carl Winter. Reprinted in: P. Dronke, *Sources of Inspiration. Studies in Literary Transformations*, 400-1500, Roma: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 1997, pp. 37-59.
- 9. Duclow, Donald F. 1972. "Pseudo-Dionysius, John Scotus Eriugena, Nicholas of Cusa: An Approach to the Hermeneutic of the Divine Names." *International Philosophical Quarterly* no. 12:260-278.
- 11. ——. 1977. "Divine Nothingness and Self-Creation in John Scotus Eriugena." *The Journal of Religion* no. 57:109-123.
- 12. ——. 1980. "Dialectic and Christology in Eriugena's *Periphyseon*." *Dionysius*:99-117.

  Reprinted as Essay IV in: D. F. Duclow, *Masters of Learned Ignorance: Eriugena, Eckhart, Cusanus*.
- Aldershot: Ashgate.
  Contents: Preface VII; Acknowledgments XI; Introduction. I. Pseudo-Dionysius, John Scottus Eriugena, Nicholas of Cusa: An Approach to the Hermeneutic of the Divine Names 3; Part I: *John Scottus Eriugena*. II. Divine Nothingness and Self-Creation in John Scottus Eriugena 23; III. Nature as Speech and Book in John Scottus Eriugena 41; IV. Dialectic and Christology in Eriugena's *Periphyseon* 49; V. Isaiah Meets the Seraph: Breaking Ranks in Dionysius and Eriugena? 67; VI. Denial or Promise of the Tree of Life?: Eriugena, Augustine, and Genesis 3:22b 85; VII: Virgins in Paradise: Deification and Exegesis in *Periphyseon V* (co-authored with Paul A. Dietrich) 101; VIII. Hell and Damnation in Eriugena (co-authored with Paul A. Dietrich) 121-138.
- 14. Dutton, Paul Edward. 1980. "Raoul Glaber's 'De diuina quaternitate' An Unnoticed Reading of Eriugena's Translation of the *Ambigua* of Maximmus the Confessor." *Mediaeval Studies* no. 42:431-453.
- 15. ——. 1986. "Eriugena, the Royal Poet." In *Jean Scot écrivain*, edited by Allard, Guy-H., 51-80. Paris: Vrin.

- 16. ——. 1992. "Evidence that Dubthach' Priscian Codex Once Belonged to Eriugena." In *From Athens to Chartres. Neoplatonism and Medieval Thought. Studies in Honour of Edouard Jeauneau*, edited by Westra, Haijo Jan, 15-45. Leiden: Brill.
  - "Leiden B.P.L. 67 is a celebrated and much described codex containing three works of Priscian: the *Periegesis* (fols. 1-7), *Institutiones grammaticae* (9-207), and *De nominibus et pronominibus* (208-218). The last of these items was copied in the twelfth century, but the first two were written out by Irish scribes in the middle of the ninth century. One of these scribes was a certain Dubthach who claimed, in a clever inscription left at the end of the *Periegesis*, to have completed copying the book on 11 April 838 at exactly 3 p.m. Despite the final flourish, Dubthach seems to have been but one of several scribes who produced the Periegesis and Institutiones. His name, however, is an especially significant one since Traube associated him with Sedulius Scottus' Irish circle, and the so-called Cryptogram of Dubthach in Bamberg reminds one of the playful inscription in Leiden. Dubthach and his fellow scribes seem to have copied out their collection of Prisciana on the continent, perhaps for the use of a colony of Irish scholars.

In piecing together the history of the Dubthach Codex (as I shall henceforth call fols. 1-207) an important element has been overlooked, for after its creation the codex seems to have passed into the possession of Eriugena and his school. The evidence for this is a series of fragments—a miscellany of notes, five poems, a list of Greek grammatical terms, an excerpt from the *Periphyseon*, a commentary on Priscian's "De uoce," and glosses by the Irish scribe known as i<sup>1</sup>—that place the manuscript in the presence of the Irish philosopher and his circle between 853 and 866. A number of these fragments are edited here for the first time. These remnants of Eriugena and his school fall into three discrete parts of the Dubthach Codex and will be so presented and studied below." (pp. 15-16 notes omitted).

- 17. ——. 1997. "Minding Irish P's and Q's: Signs of the First Systematic Reading of Eriugena's *'Periphyseon*'." In *A Distinct Voice. Medieval Studies in Honor of Leonard E. Boyle, O.P.*, edited by Brown, Jacqueline and Stoneman, William P., 14-31. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
- 18. ——. 2002. "Eriugena's Workshop: the Making of the *Periphyseon* in Reims 875." In *History and Eschatology in John Scottus Eriugena and His Time*, edited by McEvoy, James and Dunne, Michael, 141-168. Leuven: Leuven University Press.
- 19. Dutton, Paul Edward, and Luhtala, Anneli. 1994. "Eriugena in Priscianum." *Mediaeval Studies* no. 56:153-163.
- Erismann, Christophe. 2002. "Generalis essentia. La théorie érigénienne de l' ousia et le problème des universaux." Archives d'Histoire Doctrinale et Littéraire du Moyen-Age no. 69:7-37.
   "La problématique philosophique d'Erigène catégories, universaux, individuation -
  - "La problématique philosophique d'Erigène catégories, universaux, individuation se noue autour de la notion d'ousia, comprise soit comme l'essence générale, genre suprême unique, soit comme substance particulière. En opposition aux *Catégories*, Jean Scot défend un réalisme radical, concevant l'individuation comme accidentelle et le particulier comme un rassemblement de propriétés universelles. Guillaume de Champeaux reprendra cette position dans sa théorie réaliste dite de l'essence matérielle."
- 21. ——. 2002. ""Causa essentialis". De la cause comme principe dans la métaphysique de Jean Scot Erigène." Quaestio. Yearbook of the History of Metaphysics no. 2:187-215.
- 22. . 2003. "Erigène et la subsistance du corps." *Studia Philosophica* no. 62:91-105.
- 23. ——. 2004. "Processio id est multiplicatio. L'influence latine de l'ontologie de Porphyre: le cas de Jean Scot Érigène." Revue des Sciences Philosophiques et Théologiques no. 88:401-460.

- "Porphyre fait subir dans l' *Isagoge* une inflexion platonicienne au système ontologique des *Catégories* d'Aristote et investit les catégories d'une signification métaphysique. Plusieurs penseurs du haut Moyen âge les réalistes ont amplifié et explicité cette métaphysique. La lecture et l'usage ontologiques de l' *Isagoge* par Jean Scot Erigène, dans son *Periphyseon*, est à ce titre un cas d'école. Influencé par le néoplatonisme tardif de Proclus, Jean Scot se sert des outils conceptuels de l' *Isagoge* pour élaborer son système philosophique."
- 24. ——. 2005. "Alain de Lille, la métaphysique érigénienne et la pluralité des formes." In *Alain de Lille, le Docteur universel. Philosophie, théologie et littérature au XIIe siècle. Actes du XIe Colloque international de la Société internationale pour l'Étude de la Philosophie médiévale, Paris, 23-25 octobre 2003*, edited by Solère, Jean-Luc, Vasiliu, Anca and Galonnier, Alain, 19-46. Turnhout: Brepols.
- 25. ——. 2006. "Dialectique, universaux et intellect chez Jean Scot Erigène." In *Intellect et imagination dans la philosophie médiévale / Intellect and Imagination in Medieval Philosophy / Intelecto e imaginação na filosofia medieval*, edited by Pacheco, Maria Cândida and Meirinhos, José Francesco, 827-840. Turnhout: Brepols.
  - Actes du XIe Congrès international de philosophie médiévale de la Société internationale pour l'Étude de la philosophie médiévale (S.I.E.P.M.), Porto, du 26 au 31 août 2002, vol. II.
- 26. ——. 2007. "The Logic of Being: Eriugena's Dialectical Ontology." In *The Many Roots of Medieval Logic: The Aristotelian and the Non-Aristotelian Traditions*, edited by Marenbon, John, 203-218. Leiden: Brill.

Abstract: "In his major work, the *Periphyseon*, the ninth century Latin philosopher John Scottus Eriugena gives, with the help of what he calls "dialectic", a rational analysis of reality.

According to him, dialectic is a science which pertains both to language and reality. Eriugena grounds this position in a realist ontological exegesis of the Aristotelian categories, which are conceived as categories of being. His interpretation tends to transform logical patterns, such as Porphyry's Tree or the doctrine of the categories, into a structure which is both ontological and logical, and to use them as tools for the analysis of the sensible world. The combination of dialectic interpreted as a science of being, capable of expressing truths about the sensible world as well as about discourse, with an ontological interpretation of logical concepts allows Eriugena to develop his metaphysical theory, a strong realism. Eriugena not only supports a theological realism (of divine ideas), but also, and principally, an ontological realism, the assertion of the immanent existence of forms. Eriugena claims that genera and species really subsist in the individuals: they are completely and simultaneously present in each of the entities which belong to them."

27. — . 2011. L'homme commun. La genèse du réalisme ontologique durant le haut Moyen âge. Paris: Vrin.

"Le présent livre propose l'étude de la constitution, durant le haut Moyen Âge latin, d'une position philosophique: le réalisme de l'immanence à propos des universaux. Cette position est fondée sur la conviction qu'il existe, dans le monde qui nous entoure, certes des individus particuliers -- ce tilleul, cette tortue --, mais aussi des entités universelles. Ces entités n'existent pas séparées des individus, mais intégralement réalisées en eux, sans variation ni degré. Cet engagement philosophique résulte d'une exégèse des *Catégories* d'Aristote, réinterprétées selon des philosophèmes issus de la pensée de Porphyre. La généalogie de cette position est ici retracée en abordant successivement ses sources tant grecques que latines et ses ancêtres patristiques (avant tout Grégoire de Nysse), puis son élaboration conceptuelle durant les premiers siècles du Moyen Âge latin jusqu'à la critique qu'en donnera Pierre Abélard, et ce, par l'analyse de l'ontologie des quatre philosophes qui l'ont soutenue: Jean Scot Érigène, Anselme de Canterbury, Odon de Cambrai et Guillaume de Champeaux. Ce parcours permet de dessiner les contours d'un projet

- philosophique: comprendre, analyser et décrire le monde sensible au moyen des concepts issus de la logique aristotélicienne.".
- 28. Eswein, Karl. 1930. "Die Wesenheit bei Johannes Scottus Eriugena. Begriff, Bedeutung und Charakter der "essentia" oder "ousía" bei demselben." *Philosophisches Jahrbuch* no. 43:189-206.

"This author's view is that even if it were to be conceded that Eriugena did not directly influence the solution to major universal questions posed by later philosophers, it must be conceded that he made an outstanding contribution to the development of later, and

particularly modern German, philosophy. Eriugena was not a precise writer: he employs dialectic adroitly to suit the point in hand, but his system must be studied in its totality. His christian platonism is fundamentally affected by Aristotelianism. His negative

theology is not pessimistic. Eriugena's particular interpretation of certain Aristotelian terms is discussed. In this discussion on essentia as treated by Eriugena, the author devotes 7 sections to the subject: 1 General; 2) Essence and Ideas or *causae primordiales*;

- 3) Essence and Being; 4) Essence and Substance; 5) Essence and Nature; 6) Essence and Body, Genus and Species; 7) Essence and Form, Matter." (Brennan, p. 170).
- 29. Faes de Mottoni, Barbara. 1979. Il platonismo medievale. Torno: Loescher.
- 30. Flasch, Kurt. 1971. "Zur rehabilitierung der Relation: die Theorie der Beziehung bei Johannes Eriugena." In *Philosophie als Beziehungswissenschaft. Festschrift für Julius Schaaf*, edited by Niebel, Wilhelm Friedrich and Leisegang, Dieter, 1-25. Frankfurt am Main: H. Heiderhoff.
  - "This article deals with the tradition of the term *relatio*, successively depreciated from Aristotle onwards, which is, according to St. Thomas, the least of entities. The article sets out to show that in endeavouring to apply the Aristotelian categories to God, in his
  - day Eriugena harked back to late Platonism, seeking to revise the status of the relation category (otherwise *habitus/habitudo* in his terminology), but his negative theology complicates the exposition of his doctrine. The emphasis Eriugena gives to certain correlative
  - categories, particularly those of Rest and Motion, is discussed. The author draws attention to the inexactness at times of Eriugena's terminology. A connection is made early in the article with Copernicus through Nicholas of Cusa. Finally connection is also made with Bonaventure, as well as with William of Ockham, Raymond Llull, Meister Eckhart and Pico della Mirandola." (Brennan, p. 289).
- 31. Forrrai, Réka. 2008. "The Notes of Anastasius on Eriugena's Translation of the *Corpus Dionysiacum.*" *The Journal of Medieval Latin* no. 18:74-100.
- 32. Fournier, Michael. 2009. "Eriugena Five Modes (*Periphyseon* 443A-446A)." *Heytrop Journal* no. 50:581-589.
- 33. Foussard, Jean-Claude. 1977. "Apparence et apparition: la notion de "phantasia" chez Jean Scot." In *Jean Scot Erigène et l'histoire de la philosophie*, edited by Roques, René, 337-348. Paris: Éditions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique.
- 34. Frakes, Jerold C. 1988. "Remigius of Auxerre, Eriugena, and the Grec-Latin Circumstantiae-Formula of *Accessus ad Auctores*." In *The Sacred Nectar of the Greeks: The Study of Greek in the West in the Early Middle Ages*, edited by Herren, Michael W. and Brown, Ann Shirley, 257-276. London: King's College. "Prefixed to seven of the commentaries attributed to Remigius of Auxerre are brief pedagogical prefaces, accessus, which introduce author and work, The various types of accessus found in the Remigian commentaries are distinguishable by the designated set of required topics of discussion. In the commentary on Priscian's *Institutio de nomine, pronomine, et verbo*, a four-fold formula of accessus is found (*persona, locus, tempus, causa scribendi*); in the commentaries on Donatus' *Ars*

prima Bede's De arte metrica and Eutyches' De verbo, it is a three-fold formula (persona, locus, tempus); and in the commentaries on Sedulius' Carmen Paschale and Martianus Capella's De Nuptiis Philologiae et Mercurii, a seven-fold circumstantiae/periochae formula (puis, Quid, cur, quomodo, quando, ubi, quibus facultatibus); the commentary on the Disticha Catonis notes all three formulae." (p. 229 notes omitted)

(...)

"The pervasive influence on Remigius by his Irish forebears, especially Eriugena and Martin of Laon, is a scholarly commonplace, for which there are also abundant examples in regard to the present topic: Remigius, for instance, used the commentaries of both Eriugena and Martin/Pseudo-Dunchad on Martianus in his own commentary on the work. Further, in the Remigian commentary on Priscian, the four-fold accessus formula appears immediately after a reference to Eriugena. Eriugena seems not just to be his major source in this regard, but more generally a primary model of scholarly method. It is this type of influence which is of essential significance here, for around the middle of the ninth century one notes a gradual shift in emphasis in Irish scholarship on the continent, especially in the work of Sedulius Scottus and Eriugena, away from grammatical studies towards commentary on what were to become "school authors." It was in this nascent period of the formulation of a school canon that the accessus began to develop." (p. 240) (...)

"However, instead of taking Remigius' position in this generation of scholarly modification as prima facie evidence for his own invention or mediation of scholarly devices such as the accessus, and any and all occurrences thereof as evidence for Remigian authorship, it would perhaps be more to the point to consider another interpretive possibility, which in context seems more to the point than Lutz's [\*] rather strained thesis: the Irish background of the accessus. One example thereof has already been mentioned: Sedulius on Donatus, De octo partibus orationis In his Collectaneum in Apostolum, the substantive and interrogative forms of the seven circumstantiae also appear as determinative categories in the formation of the preface." (p. 241 note omitted)

[\*] Cora E. Lutz, "One Formula of *Accessus* in Remigius' work", *Latomus* 19 (1960), 774-780.

Gautier Dalché, Patrick. 1991. "Deux lectures et un commentaire de Jean Scot:

Censorinus, Aulu-Gelle (livres I et III) et Bède le Vénérable." Revue d'histoire des textes no. 21:115-133.

Résumé: "Dans Periphyseon, III, à propos de Gen., I, 14, Jean Scot développe des explications sur les intervalles des corps célestes où l'on reconnaît des échos de deux oeuvres considérées comme ayant peu ou pas circulé au IXe siècle: Censorinus, De die natali, 13; le premier livre d'Aulu-Gelle, dont il n'existe pas de ms. avant le XIIe siècle. L'article examine leur tradition (avec un excursus sur la Compilation de 809-810) et montre qu'ils furent connus dans des milieux proches de l'Érigène: les

monastères de la région de la Loire (Loup et Heiric) ; Laon (les Scotti, et notamment Martin). Divers indices semblent en outre prouver que Jean Scot

commenta le De temporum ratione de Bède.".

- 36. Gersh, Stephen. 1977. ""Per se ipsum": The Problem of Immediate and Mediate Causation in Eriugena and his Neoplatonic Predecessors." In *Jean Scot Erigène et l'histoire de la philosophie*, edited by Roques, René, 367-376. Paris: Éditions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique.

  Reprinted in: S. Gersh. *Reading Plato. Tracing Plato. From Ancient Commentary to* 
  - Reprinted in: S. Gersh, Reading Plato, Tracing Plato. From Ancient Commentary to Medieval Reception, Aldershot: Ashgate, Essay IX.
- 37. ——. 1978. From Iamblichus to Eriugena: An Investigation of the Prehistory and Evolution of the Pseudo-Dionysian Tradition. Leiden: Brill.

  Italian translation: Da Giamblico a Eriugena. Origini e sviluppi della tradizione pseudo-dionisiana, Edizione italiana a cura di Marialucrezia Leone e Christoph

35.

- Helmig, Bari, Edizioni di Pagina, 2009, with a new Preface by S. Gersh (pp. VII-IX) and a Supplement to the Bibliography (2008) pp. 424-457.
- 38. ——. 1980. "Omnipresence in Eriugena. Some Reflections on Augustino-Maximian Elements in *Periphyseon*." In *Eriugena. Studien zu seinen Quellen*, edited by Beierwaltes, Werner, 55-74. Heidelberg: Carl Winter. Reprinted in: S. Gersh, *Reading Plato, Tracing Plato. From Ancient Commentary to Medieval Reception*, Aldershot: Ashgate, Essay X.
- 39. ——. 1987. "Honorius Augustodunensis and Eriugena. Remarks on the Method and Content of the *Clavis Physicae*." In *Eriugena Redivivus. Zur Wirkungeschichte seines Denkens im Mittelalter und im Übergang zur Neuzeit*, edited by Beierwaltes, Werner, 162-173. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.

  Reprinted in: S. Gersh, *Reading Plato, Tracing Plato. From Ancient Commentary to Medieval Reception*, Aldershot: Ashgate, Essay XV.
- 40. ——. 1990. "The Structure of the Return in Eriugena's *Periphyseon*." In *Begriff und Metapher. Sprachform des Denkens bei Eriugena*, edited by Beierwaltes, Werner, 108-125. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.

Reprinted in: S. Gersh, *Reading Plato, Tracing Plato. From Ancient Commentary to Medieval Reception*, Aldershot: Ashgate, Essay XI.

"The 'return' has hitherto been among the less studied aspects of Eriugena's doctrine. This single word is the English translation of various Latin technical terms (primarily *reditus*, *redire* and *reversio*, *reverti*) for the motion of created things towards their creator(1). As the counterbalance to the originative motion of the creature called 'procession' (*processio*, *procedere*), it is conceived at the same time as a cancellation and a development of the latter(2). This ambivalence makes the return one of the most difficult aspects of *Periphyseon* to interpret.

Analysis of the structure of the return begins from the notion of God representing the end of the process. According to the fourfold interpretation of Nature which dominates the text, God is both source and goal of all creative activity: this duality arising not in his objective nature but in our subjective perceptions of it. So God is named as end to the extent that he possesses such a 'relation to created things' (habitudo ad ea quae condita sunt)(3) or that we have this kind of 'concept' (ratio) of him(4). Here as elsewhere, the ideas of relativity and subjectivity are tightly interwoven in the texture of Eriugenian thought. According to the same fourfold schema, God is defined as that nature which neither creates nor is created. What this definition already implies is spelled out in various texts: after this world has reached its end in God, there will be no further productive act on the creator's part(5), no further procession into intelligible and sensible multiplicity(6). In other words, a cyclic regeneration of the cosmos in the Origenistic manner is systematically excluded.

Such allusions to the notions of *reversio - reditus* are foundational in the sense that they raise the question of the transcendent ground of the process. However, the concept of return also implies the presence of an immanent divine principle not only in the culmination but also in the unfolding of the process. According to Eriugena, after the return of created things, God will be 'all in all' ('*omnia in omnibus*') in a manner analogous to that of light's presence in air(7). But God is also 'all in all' at this moment, although the carnality of fallen man makes it difficult to conceive how this can be(8)."

- (1) There seems to be no significant difference between the meanings of the pair *reditus-redire* and the pair *reversio-reverti*. Both sets of terms correspond roughly to the pair *epistrophe-epistrephein* in Pseudo-Dionysius the basic source of Eriugena's Neoplatonism in its developed form.
- (2) The doctrine of procession has been studied in S. Gersh: From lamblichus to Eriugena. An Investigation of the Prehistory and Evolution of the Pseudo-Dionysian Tradition, Leiden 1978, passim.
- (3) Eriugena: Periph. II. 528A.
- (4) II. 527B. Cf. V. 1019A.

- (5) V. 1019B.
- (6) IV. 860 B.
- (7) V. 935 C.
- (8) III. 683C.
- 41. ——. 1996. Concord in Discourse: Harmonics and Semiotics in Late Classical and Early Medieval Platonism. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.

"The notion of "structure" (1) can be interpreted ontologically or semantically—that is, with the structured terms corresponding to existent things or to semantic properties (2)—and in modem times it is the second viewpoint which has predominated. (3) Why? Undoubtedly because structure itself is seen to be significant and signification itself to be structured." (p. 4) (...)

"As originally suggested, the notion of "structure" can be interpreted ontologically or semantically — where the structured terms correspond to existent things or to semantic properties. (72) Although in modem times it is the second approach which has been dominant, in the ancient and medieval worlds the two approaches were pursued concurrently with the second dependent on the first. (73) Our project is therefore to employ the modem semantic notion of structure to interpret both the ancient ontological and the ancient semantic notions of structure in an intertextual reading. (74) But since the corresponding term structura is unknown or rare in the relevant passages, we must begin the detailed analysis with its primary surrogate. (75)" (p. 9)

- (2) The structured terms can also be treated as mental concepts. See pp. 7-8. In practice, this approach frequently turns into a variant of the ontological.
- (3) See Eco 1968: 63, 361, 395; Greimas 1970: 39; Eco 1976: 83-84; Greimas Courtés 1979:311-313.
- (72) See p. 4.
- (73) See n. 3.
- (74) The modem semantic theory of structure will be applied to the ancient ontological theory of structure in chapters two and three; and to the ancient ontological and semantic theories of structure in chapter four.
- (75) According to L & S [Liddell & Scott, *Greek–English Lexicon*], in the classical period *structura* only signified a physical building. When Cicero occasionally applied it to the arrangement of words, he noted that this was a strictly figurative usage (*quasi structura*...) Cf. Lausberg 1960, 2: 818.

References

Umberto Eco 1968, *La struttura assente*, Milano, Bompiani 1968 Umberto Eco 1976, *A Theory of Semiotics*, Bloomington/IN: Indian University Press.

Algirdas J. Greimas 1970, *Du sens*. Essais sémiotiques, 2 volumes, Paris: Seuil. Algirdas J. Greimas and Joseph Courtés 1979-1986, *Sémiotique*. Dictionnaire raisonné de la thérorie du langage. 2 volumes. Paris: Hachette.

On Eriugena see in particular:

Chapter: 2.1 Eriugena and the square of opposition 69-73; 2.3 Eriugena's theory of relation 77-86; 2. 5 Eriugena's theory of ratio 89-97; 2.6 Extensions of the Eriugenian theory of ratio 97-104; 3.5 Mediation in the cosmology and angelology of Eriugena 141-156; 3.6 The Eriugenian transcendent harmony 156-166; 4.1 Eriugena and the triad of signifier, signified, and signification 181-188; 4.3 Eriugena's theory of signification 191-199; 4.5 Eriugena's theory of symbolism 201-216; 4.6 Extensions of the Eriugenian theory of symbolism 216-220.

42. ——. 1996. "Eriugena 's Ars Rhetorica - Theory and Practice." In Iohannes Scottus Eriugena. The Bible and Hermeneutics, edited by Riel, Gerd van, Steel, Carlos and McEvoy, James, 261-278. Leuven: Leuven University Press. Reprinted in: S. Gersh, Reading Plato, Tracing Plato. From Ancient Commentary to Medieval Reception, Aldershot: Ashgate, Essay XII.

- 43. ——. 1998. "John Scottus Eriugena and Anselm of Canterbury." In *Routledge History of Philosophy. Volume III: Medieval hilosophy*, edited by Marenbon, John, 120-149. New York: Routledge.
- 44. ——. 1998. "Structure, Sign, and Ontology from Iohannes Scottus Eriugena to Anselm of Canterbury." In *Routledge History of Philosophy. Vol. II: Medieval Philosophy*, edited by Marenbon, John, 124-149. New York: Routledge.
- 45. ——. 2001. "Cratylus mediaevalis. Ontology and Polysemy in Medieval Platonism (to ca. 1200)." In Poetry and Philosophy in the Middle Ages. A Festschrift for Peter Dronke, edited by Marenbon, John, 79-98. Leiden: Brill. Reprinted in: S. Gersh, Reading Plato, Tracing Plato. From Ancient Commentary to Medieval Reception, Aldershot: Ashgate, Essay II.
- 46. ——. 2006. "The Role of the Human in the Procession and Return of the Cosmos from Plotinus to Eriugena." *Dionysius* no. 24:175-208.
- 47. ——. 2009. Da Giamblico a Eriugena. Origini e sviluppi della tradizione pseudo-dionisiana. Bari: Edizioni di Pagina.

  Edizione italiana a cura di Marialucrezia Leone e Christoph Helmig con una nuova prefazione di Stephen Gersh (pp. VII-IX) ed un Supplemento alla Bibliografia (2008), pp. 424-457.
- Gersh, Stephen, and Moran, Dermot, eds. 2006. Eriugena, Berkeley, and the Idealist Tradition. Notre Dame: Indiana University Press.
   A collection of papers originally delivered at an international conference organized in Dublin in March 2002 by the University of Notre Dame and Trinity College Dublin.
  - Contents: Stephen Gersh and Dermot Moran: Introduction 1; Chapter 1: Vasilis Politis: Non-subjective idealism in Plato (Sophist 248e-249d) 14; Chapter 2: John Dillon: The platonic forms as Gesetze: could Paul Natorp have been right? 39; Chapter 3: Vittorio Hösle: Platonism and its interpretations: the three paradigms and their place in the history of hermeneutics 54; Chapter 4: Gretchen Reydams-Schils: The Roman Stoics on divine thinking and human knowledge 81; Chapter 5: Andrew Smith: The object of perception in Plotinus 95; Chapter 6:Jean Pépin: Saint Augustine and the indwelling of the ideas in God 105; Chapter 7: Dermot Moran: Spiritualis incrassatio: Eriugena's intellectualist immaterialism: is it an idealism? 123; Chapter 8: Stephen Gersh: Eriugena's fourfold contemplation: idealism and arithmetic 151; Chapter 9: Agnieszka Kijewska: Eriugena's idealist interpretation of paradise 168; Chapter 10: Peter Adamson: Immanence and transcendence: intellect and forms in al-Kindi and the *Liber de causis* 187; Chapter 11: Bertil Belfrage: The scientific background of George Berkeley's idealism 202; Chapter 12: Timo Airaksinen: The chain and the animal: idealism in Berkeley's Siris 224; Chapter 13: Karl Ameriks: Idealism from Kant to Berkeley 244; Chapter 14: Walter Jaeschke: Idealism and realism in classical German philosophy 269; Bibliography 285; Index 301-318.
- 49. Gersh, Stephen, and Stéphany, Cédric. 2013. "L'*Ordo Naturalis* des causes primordiales. La transformation érigénienne de la doctrine dionysienne des noms divins." *Les Études philosophiques*:57-78.
- 50. Gierer, Alfred. 1999. "Eriugena, Al-Kindi, Nikolaus von Kues Protagonisten einer wissenschaftsfreundlichen Wende im philosophischen und theologischen Denken." *Acta Historica Leopoldina* no. 29:7-60.
  - With summarizing English version: Eriugena, Al-Kindi, Nicholaus of Cusa Protagonists of Pro-scientific Cultural Change in Philosophical and Theological Thought.
  - "Ancient Greek philosophers were the first to postulate the possibility of explaining nature in theoretical terms and to initiate attempts at this. With the rise of monotheistic religions of revelation claiming supremacy over human reason and envisaging a new world to come, studies of the natural order of the transient world were widely considered undesirable. Later, in the Middle Ages, the desire for human

understanding of nature in terms of reason was revived. This article is concerned with the fundamental reversal of attitudes, from "undesirable" to "desirable", that eventually led into the foundations of modern science. One of the earliest, most ingenious and most interesting personalities involved was Eriugena, a theologian at the Court of Charles the Bald in the 9th century. Though understanding what we call nature is only one of the several aspects of his philosophical work, his line of thought implies a turn into a pro-scientific direction: the natural order is to be understood in abstract terms of "primordial causes"; understanding nature is considered to be the will of God; man encompasses the whole of creation in a physical as well as a mental sense. Basically similar ideas on the reconciliation of scientific rationality and monotheistic religions of revelation were conceived, independently and nearly simultaneously, by the Arab philosopher al-Kindi in Bagdad. Eriugena was more outspoken in his claim that reason is superior to authority. This claim is implicit in the thought of Nicholas of Cusa with his emphasis on human mental creativity as the image of God's creativity; and it is the keynote of Galileo's "Letter to the Grand Duchess Christina" some 800 years later, the manifesto expressing basic attitudes of modern science.".

- 51. Giltner, T. Alexander. 2016. "Intimae Theologiae. The Christocentric Cosmology of John Scottus Eriugena in the Homilia super « In principio erat Verbum »." Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Âge no. 83:7-32.

  Abstract: "The Christology of John Scottus Eriugena has often been criticized as underdeveloped or ignored. This is because Eriugena has primarily been studied by scholars of philosophy and not theology, who focus almost exclusively on the Periphyseon. This article contends that this mischaracterization occurs because scholars are not looking for it in the right place: the Homily. Here Eriugena most clearly elucidates the contours of his Christological thought, which is truly a Christocentric cosmology."
  - "Conclusion: At the outset, I proposed that examining the *Homilia* in some depth could fill a lacuna in Eriugena scholarship in two ways: 1) this would give attention to an important work in understanding the thought of Eriugena that has been as of yet understudied in Eriugena studies; and 2) it would elucidate the central importance of Christology in Eriugena's work. John Scottus Eriugena belongs, it seems, to that coterie of medieval thinkers such as Anselm of Canterbury and Thomas Aquinas who have long been celebrated by philosophers, whereas the more theological trajectories have often been marginalized." (p. 31).
- Gordon Moore, Kate. 1947. "Johannes Scotus Erigena on Imagination." *The Journal of Psychology* no. 23:169-178.

  "It is in his philosophical and theological discussions that we must look for Erigena's views on psychological topics. In the quality of his prayer we see his interest in intellect, and where he discusses the relation of reason to authority he clearly places reason first. The authority of the church is to be accepted because it is in conformity with reason, rather than reason to be accepted because it conforms to the church. Rational truth is as the genus, .with the truths of the church as species. He seems to subsume theology under philosophy.

  The ideas which appear to have value for the student of the imaginative process are these: (a) The concept of creative goodness, which Erigena makes the center of his thought, (b) the relation between the thought and its object, (c) the idea of the union of minds, which he illustrates by esthetic experiences, and by social intellection.
- 53. Gracia, Jorge J.E. 2007. "Ontological Characterization of the Relation between Man and Created Nature in Eriugena." *Journal of the History of Philosophy* no. 16:155-166.

These will be the divisions of our discussion." (p. 171).

54. Graff, Eric. 2002. "A primitive text of *Periphyseon V* rediscovered. The witness of Honorius Augustoduniensis in *Clavis physicae*." *Recherches de Théologie et Philosophie Médiévales* no. 69:271-295.

- "Book V of Eriugena's *Periphyseon* presents new critical problems because of the lack of the Rheims manuscript, which contains the author's own revisions. The text which has been called *Versio Prima* in the first four books of Jeauneau's new edition is lacking for the final volume. Working from a transcription of the second portion of the *Clauis Physicae*, the epitome of the *Periphyseon* by Honorius Augustodunensis, the author reports that the unpublished *Clauis II* contains a text of *Periphyseon* V that is analogous to *Versio Prima*. This article first compares the transcription from *Clauis II* to Lucentini's notes on Honorius' work, then it analyses the difference between *Clauis II* and *Versio Secunda* in *Periphyseon* V. The relationship is found to be the same as that between the primitive text (*Versio Prima*) of *Periphyseon* in books I-IV and Eriugena's revised version (*Versio Secunda*). Consequently, *Clauis II* should be recognized as an essential witness to the early text of *Periphyseon* V.".
- 55. Greetham, David C. 2005. "Édouard Jeauneau's Edition of the *Periphyseon* in Light of Contemporary Editorial Theory." *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* no. 79:527-548.
  - "Textual criticism and the scholarly editions it produces have all too often been regarded by academics as well as general readers as "objective" (or even "scientific") applications of a fixed set of procedures, designed to create a "definitive" text. But such editions are just as much a reflection of cultural and ideological expectations as are any other "critical" activities. Thus, the Jeauneau parallel-text edition of Eriugena's *Periphyseon*, with its presentation of "matière en fusion" and its embrace of a continually evolving work in "perpétuel devenir" is to be seen as an appropriate postmodernist celebration of the "supplément," the marginal, the incomplete, and the fragmented. In this promotion of the "scriptible" (or "open," "writerly") text over the "lisible" ("closed" or "readerly"), Jeauneau stands in contrast with the precedent edition of Eriugena by Sheldon-Williams, which is a modernist attempt to arrive at "satisfaction" and the positive." (p. 527).
- 56. Gregory, Tullio. 1963. *Giovanni Scoto Eriugena. Tre studi*. Firenze: Le Monnier. Indice: I. Dall'Uno al Molteplice 1-26; II. Mediazione e incarnazione nella filosofia dell'Eriugena 27-57; III. 58-82.
- 57. Guiu, Adrian. 2013. "Le *Periphyseon* d'Érigène comme une extrapolation de l'*Ambiguum* 41 de Maxime le Confesseur." *Les Études philosophiques*:79-99.
- 58. ——, ed. 2019. A Companion to John Scottus Eriugena. Leiden: Brill.
- 59. ——. 2021. "Philosophical Dialogue and Contemplation of the Cosmos in Augustine, Boethius, and Eriugena." In *Studia patristica. Vol. 122: Papers presented at the eighteenth international conference on patristic studies held in Oxford 2019 / ed. by Markus Vinzent. 19, Eriugena's Christian neoplatonism and its sources in patristic and ancient philosophy*, edited by Ramelli, Ilaria L. E., 29-262. Leuven: Peeters.
  - Abstract: "In this essay I discuss the *Periphyseon* as a philosophical dialogue comparing it with two other philosophical dialogues that have preceded it: Augustine's *De ordine* and Boethius' *De consolatione philosophiae*; the goal is to discern some common elements and differences in order to shed light on less obvious aspects of the *Periphyseon*. Moreover, this essay is part of a larger project that tries to retrieve the philosophical dialogue tradition."
- 60. Hankey, Wayne J. 1998. "The Postmodern Retrieval of Neoplatonism in Jean-Luc Marion and John Milbank and the Origins of Western Dubjectivity in Augustine and Eriugena." *Hermathena* no. 165:9-70.
- 61. Heide, Daniel. 2015. "Ἀποκατάστασις: The Resolution of Good and Evil in Origen and Eriugena." *Dionysius* no. 33:195-213.

  "Introduction: While the doctrine of apokatastasis, or universal return holds a central place in the thought of many Patristic writers, it has received relatively little scholarly attention. In what follows, I hope to redress this imbalance by analysing and comparing two of the greatest proponents of this doctrine: Origen (3rd cen.) and

Eriugena (9th cen.). Although separated by obstacles of time, tradition, and language, the influence of the former upon the latter is well attested. Nowhere is this so evident as in Eriugena's discussion of the universal return of human nature in Book V of the Periphyseon. In the course of this exposition, I hope to demonstrate both the deep continuity that exists between Origen and Eriugena – the former the greatest ancient advocate of apokatastasis and the latter its greatest mediaeval proponent – as well some crucial ways in which they differ. While Eriugena's discussion of the return shows him to be a true, latter day disciple of the "blessed Origen," his Augustinian influences result in significant qualifications to the apokatastasis doctrine. As such, Eriugena's treatment of the universal return offers a unique example of the creative encounter between the Eastern and Western theological traditions." (p. 195).

- 62. ——. 2018. "σῶμα ψυχικόν, σῶμα πνευματικόν. The Fate of Bodies in Origen and Eriugena." *Dionysius* no. 36:53-65.
- 63. Herren, Michael W. 1986. "The Commentary on Martianus Attributed to John Scottus: its Hiberno-Latin Background." In *Jean Scot écrivain*, edited by Allard, Guy-H., 265-286. Paris: Vrin.

Reprinted in M. Herren, *Latin Letters in Early Christian Ireland*, Aldershot: Ashgate, 1996, Essay IV.

"In the present paper I would like to try to shed some new light on the old problem of what John may have read in Ireland and what kinds of literary skills he may have acquired there, including such items as Greek grammar, Latin metrics, and Latin vocabulary. As it is generally believed that John came to the continent at some point in his adult life, it would seem likely that he did not acquire all the erudition that he displays from continental scholars (2). Of course, we have no way of proving what John did learn at home; we are, however, in a reasonably good position to show what was available to the Irish - always bearing in mind that it is not easy to establish what aspects of Irish learning were available at home only, what in Irish centres on the continent only, and what in both places.

The so-called *Annotationes in Marcianum* obviously provide one of the best means of assessing John's reading and learning, since Martianus' encyclopedia embraces nearly all the areas of knowledge available to the ninth century. Moreover, the *Annotationes* frequently cite sources by name, and individual notes reveal a great deal about the technical learning of the author in such matters as astronomy, music, arithmetic, Greek grammar, and metrics. However, before we can undertake an assessment of John's learning in relation to this Irish background, it will be necessary to address the problem of the authenticity of the *Annotationes* - a problem that has puzzled students of Eriugena since their discovery and has become more complex with the discovery of more Carolingian commentaries or sets of scholia to Martianus." (pp. 265-266)

- (2) For the little that is known of John's life, see the first two chapters of M. Cappuyns, *Jean Scot Erigène: sa vie, son oeuvre, sa pensée* (Brussels 1933).
- 64. ——. 1987. "Eriugena's *Aulae siderae*, the 'Codex Aureus', and the Palatine Church of St. Mary at Compiègne." *Studi Medievali* no. 28:593-608. Reprinted in M. Herren, *Latin Letters in Early Christian Ireland*, Aldershot: Ashgate, 1996, Essay IX.
- 65. ——. 1989. "St Gall 48: a copy of Eriugena's glossed Greek Gospel." In *Tradition und Wertung. Festschrift für Franz Brunhölzl zum 65. Geburstag*, edited by Berndt, Günter, Rädle, Fidel and Silagi, Gabriel, 97-105. Sigmaringen: J. Thorbecke.
  - Reprinted in M. Herren, *Latin Letters in Early Christian Ireland*, Aldershot: Ashgate, 1996, Essay X.
- 66. ——. 1991. "Johannes Scottus Poeta." In *From Augustine to Eriugena. Essays on Neoplatonism and Christianity in Honor of John O'Meara*, edited by Martin, Francis X. and Richmond, John A., 92-106. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.

- 67. ——. 1996. "John Scottus and the Biblical Manuscripts Attributed to the Circle of Sedulius." In *Iohannes Scottus Eriugena. The Bible and Hermeneutics*, edited by Riel, Gerd van, Steel, Carlos and McEvoy, James, 303-320. Leuven: Leuven University Press.
- 68. ——. 2022. "Teach Yourself Greek: The Textbook Example of John Scottus Eriugena." In *"Omniun Magistra Virtutum": Studies in Honour of Danuta R. Shanzer*, edited by Cain, Andrew and Hays, Gregory 373-390. Turnhout: Brepols.
- 69. Hibbs, Darren. 2011. "John Scottus Eriugena on the Composition of Material Bodies." *British Journal for the History of Philosophy* no. 19:385-393. "This paper examines John Scottus Eriugena's account of material bodies. Some scholars have argued that Eriugena's account prefigures Berkeleyan idealism. The interpretation offered in the paper rejects the Berkeleyan interpretation on the grounds that Eriugena, unlike Berkeley, did not propose a thoroughly immaterialist view of reality."
- 70. Hochschild, Paige E. 2007. "Ousia in the Categoriae decem and the Periphyseon of John Scottus Eriugena." In Divine Creation in Ancient, Medieval, and Early Modern Thought. Essays Presented to the Rev'd Dr Robert D. Crouse, edited by Treschow, Michael, Otten, Willemien and Hannam, Walter, 213-222. Leiden: Brill. "In this article I will show how Eriugena exploits the Categoriae decem, expanding the several notions of ousia contained therein and fitting them into a larger metaphysical framework. We shall see that Eriugena's understanding of *ousia* does not create confusion from what is obvious, as Marenbon suggests, but rather develops out of a legitimate reflection upon the philosophical content of the Latin paraphrase. While in no way diminishing the significance of more prominent influences on Eriugena's thought, the Categoriae decem may be the most important source for explaining Eriugena's notion of ousia, in its full, epistemological and potentially theological richness.(2) It is, however, a difficult and often merely suggestive source, as its varied and controversial history of interpretation indicates. To this end, I will argue that what Eriugena finds in the Categoriae decem in the way of a doctrine of ousia is clearly that of Aristotle's Categories -- not I think, a radical claim. Moreover, Eriugena shows himself able to comprehend the limits of and distinctions between the several notions of *ousia* found in the *Categoriae* decem.(3) He is quite clear that the primary ousia of the Categoriae decem is not identical with the full philosophical content of the ousia of, for example, Augustine's De Trinitate or Gregory's De hominis officio. They are distinct but surely connected. Our task is to show how these several notions of *ousia* are connected for Eriugena and by what specific paths he arrives at their connection."
  - (2) Anonymi Paraphasis Themistiana (Pseudo-Augustini Categoriae decem), in Aristoteles Latinus 1.1-5, Categoriae vel Predicamenta, ed. L Minio-Paluello (Bruges, 1961), pp. 133-175.
  - Citations will be from this edition and reference shall be made to paragraph, page, and line numbers respectively. Translations are my own. By an 'important' source we certainly do not mean an exhaustive one. By this means we simply limit the scope of our investigation.
  - (3) The assumption here is that the *Categoriae decem* is a faithful report of the content of Aristotle's *Categories*, though one which suggests directions of interpretation not explicit in Aristotle's text. Hence we occasionally use the term 'Aristotelian' loosely; as including a rich tradition of interpretation of which the *Categoriae decem* is a part.
- 71. Jacquin, Mannes. 1907. "Le néo-platonisme de Jean Scot." *Revue des Sciences philosophiques et théologiques* no. 1:674-685.
- 72. Kabaj, Józef. 1977. "Homme et nature dans la cosmologie de Jean Scot Erigena." *Studia Mediewistyczne* no. 18:3-50.
  "This article begins by tracing the history of the *term phusis/natura* from the earliest Greek philosophers onwards. The author finds the sources of Eriugena's four

divisions in Augustine, Origen and Philo of Alexandria (p. 8) as also in Marius Victorinus. Another (tripartite) variation is to be found in Claudianus Mamertus or in Boethius. The author then analyses (pp. 12 ff.) Eriugena's synthesis of patristic and platonic views while finding Aristotelian elements within his exposition. At the outset this author has declared for a Marxist interpretation of Eriugena and much of section (3) Nature as seen by Eriugen is concerned with a review of mainly 20th century scholars' judgments of his work as either dualist i.e. orthodox in christian terms, or monist/pantheist i.e. unorthodox, which would be this author's own view: thus the major themes of the *Periphyseon* are discussed, his dialectic leading, inevitably, to monism and pantheistic emanationism. Two sections (4 and 5) 'Human nature in Eriugena' and 'Man and his Existence' treat of man as microcosm, again going back to Heraclitus to trace the reception of this theory: according to Eriugena man participates in both the second and third divisions of nature. The supposed ontological dualism of Eriugena is in fact pancosmic spiritualist monism. In section (6) 'Man's cosmic consciousness' the factor of 'vital motion' is discussed. The author holds (p. 38) that Eriugena needed a fifth 'complementary' book for his *Periphyseon* because the first four did not suffice to resolve the theory of his four divisions. In a final section (7) entitled 'Dialectic of human knowledge' the problem of man's ignorance of quid sit and of the relation between gnoseology and ontology are discussed; self-knowledge (quia sit) is existence." (Brennan, pp. 232-233).

- 73. Katz, Sheri. 1990. "Two Views on John Scottus Eriugena's Use of Aristotelian Categories." *Medieval Perspectives* no. 4-5:97-110.

  Abstract: "The article examines the two opposing views on John Scottus Eriugena's use of the Aristotelian categories in "Periphyseon." It agrees with Eriugena's belief that "natura" is the name for all things under the concept of "nature." It also discusses the different divisions of nature according to Eriugena which correspond to various dogmas such as "ea quae sunt et ea quae non sunt" and "rationes aeternae" of Augustine. It also explores the position of John Marenbon in his "From the Circle of Alcuin to the School of Auxerre."
- 74. Kavanagh, Catherine. 2002. "The Philosophical Importance of Grammar for Eriugena." In *History and Eschatology in John Scottus Eriugena and His Time*, edited by McEvoy, James and Dunne, Michael, 61-76. Leuven: Leuven University Press.

"For the ancients and medievals, the discipline of grammar ultimately consisted of two parts: linguistic analysis and literary criticism.1 That linguistic speculation and textual exegesis were seen to be complementary aspects of a single Ars is due to the particular hermeneutical conception of reality which emerged from the Christian and Platonic speculation of late antiquity and the early medieval period. Late antique - Stoic and Neoplatonic - belief in the patterning of the world according to the Aoyos, or Word of God, implied a rational world which could be understood. This belief was assimilated by Christians to the account of creation given in the Book of Genesis, which in turn was read in conjunction with the Prologue to the Gospel of St. John, a text which explicitly states that all things that were made were made through the Word of God, which is God. Of course, Scripture is also the Word of God, and the identification of the Word of Creation with the Word of Scripture helped to reinforce the sense that reality is rational in being textual. Seeing as both are a product of the same intelligence, a similar logic underpins both. Thus from a Patristic and Carolingian perspective, the world really could be understood by means of a certain hermeneutic."

(...)

"Thus, the question of the relevance of medieval grammar to Eriugena's philosophical method is essentially a question of a certain kind of hermeneutic: either the obvious hermeneutic of textual study, or what one might call the metaphysical hermeneutic of linguistic structures. Certain significant features of his work are distinctively grammatical. First, there is the comparing and contrasting of several different texts from different authorities for the purposes of exegesis of a central text; second, the use of linguistic structures and grammatical figures as key

devices, not only in the explication of difficult texts, but also in the establishment of important doctrines, and last, the close philological and philosophical work involved in the translations from Greek. At times Eriugena devises a new construction to serve the philological purpose of translation, which simultaneously introduces a new idea and sets up a new kind of metaphor, e.g. his use of subsilentii2 3 \* and praetexta5, one apparently a hapax legomenon and the other a previously unknown metaphorical use of a standard word. This paper will concentrate on three important features of the grammatical tradition, dealing first with borrowings from grammatical authors, then at more length with figures of grammar and finally with issues arising out of Eriugena's approach to translation before considering the problem as a whole, and concluding." (pp. 61-63)

- (1) For a survey of ancient and medieval grammar which considers the origins and development of the discipline as a whole, see Ars minor/Ars major. Donat et la tradition de l'enseignement grammaticale. Etude sur l'Ars Donati et sa diffusion (IV-IXe siede) et edition critique, ed. Holtz, L., Paris, 1981. Introduction. Also Geschichte der Sprachwissenschaft bei den Griechen und Römern mit besonderer Rücksicht auf die Logik, Steinthal, H., 2 vols. Berlin, 1890, reprint Hildesheim/New York (Georg Olms Verlag), 1971. Also "Linguistics and Theology in the Early Medieval West" Luhtala, A., Handbuch der Sprachwissenschaft, (no. 83) Berlin/New York (De Gruyter), 2000. For an account of early medieval grammar in Britain and Ireland somewhat at odds with Holtz's presentation, see *The Insular* Latin Grammarians, Law, V., Woodbridge, (Boydell Press), 1982 and "Linguistics in the earlier Middle Ages: the Insular and Carolingian Grammarians" Law, V., in *Transactions of the Philological Society* 83 (1985), pp. 171-193. For the commentary on Priscian attributed to Eriugena, (Barcelona, Archivio de la Corona de Aragon, Ripoil 59), see "Eriugena in Priscianum," Dutton P. E. and Luhtala, A., in *Medieval Studies* 56 (1994), pp.151-161; also "Evidence that Dubhthach's Priscian Codex Once Belonged to Eriugena" Dutton P. E., in From Athens to Chartres, Neoplatonism and Medieval Thought. Studies in Honour of Edouard Jeauneau. Studien und Texte zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters, 35. Westra, H. J. Leiden, New York, Köln, (E. J. Brill) 1992, also "Grammar and Dialectic: A Topical Issue in the Ninth Century" Luhtala, A in McEvoy J. ed. with Steel, C., and Van Riel, G., Johannes Scottus Eriugena The Bible and Hermeneutics Proceedings of the Ninth International colloquium of the Society for the Promotion of Eriugenian Studies Held at Leuven and Louvain-la-Neuve June 7-10, 1995. Leuven, (University Press) 1996, pp. 279-301. For an account of the philosophical implications of the purely linguistic element in medieval grammar, see "Syntax and Dialectic in Carolingian Commentaries on Priscian's Institutiones Grammaticae" Luhtala, A., Historiographia Linguistica XX:I (1993) pp.145-191 and "Priscian's Definitions Are Obscure: Carolingian Commentators on the Institutiones grammaticae" Luhtala, A., in *Linguists and Their Diversions*. A Festschrift for R.H. Robins on His 75th Birthday. Ed. Law, V. et al. Münster, (Nodus Publikationen), 1996. "Carolingian Grammarians and Theoretical Innovation" Law, V., in Diversions of Galway: Papers from the fifth International Conference on the History of Linguistics. Ed. Ahlqvist, A. et al. Amsterdam, (Benjamins), 1992, pp. 27-38. For a more detailed presentation of the hermeneutical nature of early medieval thought, and of grammar's place in it, see Kavanagh C., The role of the
- 75. ——. 2003. "Eriugenian Developments of Ciceronian Topical Theory." In *Medieval and Renaissance Humanism. Rhetoric, Representation and Reform*, edited by Gersh, Stephen and Roest, Bert, 1-30. Leiden: Brill.

*Trivium Arts in Eriugena's Philosophical and Theological Method*. Unpublished dissertation, Notre Dame IN, (University of Notre Dame), Spring 2002, Chapter 1.

76. ——. 2005. "The influence of Maximus the Confessor on Eriugena's treatment of Aristotle's *Categories*." *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* no. 79:567-596. "The Aristotelian categories are a fundamental element in Eriugena's philosophical system on account of his realist view of dialectic. He received his texts concerning the categories from Boethius and the *De decem categoriis*, but key ideas in his

- treatment of them -- namely, the metaphysical importance of dialectic, the unknowability of essence, and the origin of being in place and time, ideas fundamentally rooted in Byzantine developments of the Christology of Chalcedon -- are taken from Maximus the Confessor. Eriugena's work on the categories represents an attempt, much misunderstood, to assimilate the richness of the Eastern tradition to Western philosophical and theological method. This paper examines the synthesis of Maximus's ideas with Ciceronian and Boethian elements in Eriugena's striking treatment of the Aristotelian *Categories*."
- 77. ——. 2009. "John Scottus Eriugena and the Uses of Dialectic " In *The Irish Contribution to European Scholastic Thought*, edited by McEvoy, James and Dunne, Michael, 21-36. Dublin: Four Courts Press.
- 78. Kendig, Elizabeth, and Lamrani, Lila. 2013. "La forme dialogique dans le *Periphyseon*: recréer l'esprit." *Les Études philosophiques*:101-119.
- 79. Kijewska, Agnieszka. 2000. "El Fundamento del sistema de Eriúgena." *Anuario filosófico* no. 33:505-532.
- 80. ——. 2011. "The conception of the First Cause in Book Two of John Scottus Eriugena's Periphyseon." *Anuario filosófico* no. 44:29-52.
- 81. Kijewska, Agnieszka, Majeran, Roman, and Schwaetzer, Harald, eds. 2011. *Eriugena - Cusanus*. Lublin: Wydawnictwo KUL. Colloquia Mediaevalia Lublinensia, Vol. 1.
- King-Farlow, John. 1992. "From Dionysius to Eriugena. A Bridge for Voluntarism of "Divine Freedom"?" *Laval théologique et philosophique* no. 48:367-378. Summary: "The moving style and apparent echoes of truly Christian Platonism left the works of Dionysius the Pseudo-Areopagite long tempting to identify with nearly authoritative writings by a friend of Saint Paul. The latter would have really lived centuries before. Centuries later the genius of John Scotus Eriugena drew copiously on the Pseudo-Areopagite, Plato, the Scriptures, etc., to provide a dazzling system of philosophy and theology. While these systems are now recovering modern interest, their ontologically Monist character and their confused attempts to uphold God's omnipotence and other perfections by absorbing creatures, merit analytical reproof. Free Will and ontological Pluralism belong with the metaphysics of the Bible. It is hoped to re-introduce the visions of two often neglected heretics."
- Kristeller, Paul Oskar. 1976. "The Historical Position of Johannes Scottus 83. Eriugena." In Latin Script and Letters A.D. 400-900. Festschrift presented to Ludwig Bieler on the Occasion of his 70th Birthday, edited by O'Meara, John Joseph and Naumann, Bernd, 156-164. Leiden: Brill. "Eriugena's example seems to show that an individual scholar and thinker may surpass the intellectual limits of his century, but that he will not perpetuate his best achievements unless they are transmitted through his pupils and embodied in the curriculum of a school that constitutes a kind of institutional tradition. It is the lack of such a school tradition before and after him, that makes of Eriugena a great but isolated figure. It took several more centuries before the acquaintance with Greek sources, this time especially with Aristotle, and the continued struggle with philosophical problems became a wide concern in the Western world. The narrow limits of the seven liberal arts were finally overcome. New institutions, the cathedral schools and universities, attracted a large number of teachers and students and thus assured a continuity and expansion of learning in a variety of subjects. Medicine and jurisprudence, philosophy and the sciences as well as dogmatic theology were constantly and widely taught, discussed and written about, and in the course of the discussions, the problems and the terminology became more and more refined. This tradition, nourished in many ways by Arabic and Latin as well as by Greek sources, has continued through many changes and transformations up to the present day. It is the everlasting glory of Eriugena that through him, and through him alone, the period from 500 to 900, interesting for a variety of political, artistic and scholarly

- contributions, also deserves a prominent mention in the history of philosophy." (p. 163).
- 84. Labowsky, Lotte. 1943. "A New version of Scotus Eriugena's Commentary on Martianus Capella." *Mediaeval and Renaissance Studies* no. 1:187-193.
- 85. Laga, Carl. 1996. "A Complete Graeco-Latin Index of Maximus Confessor's *Quaestiones ad Thalassam.*" In *Iohannes Scottus Eriugena. The Bible and Hermeneutics*, edited by Riel, Gerd van, Steel, Carlos and McEvoy, James, 169-182. Leuven: Leuven University Press.
- 86. Le Bourdellés, R. 1977. "Connaissance du grec et méthodes de traduction dans le monde carolingien jusqu'à Scot Erigène." In *Jean Scot Erigène et l'histoire de la philosophie*, edited by Roques, René. Paris: Éditions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique.
- 87. Lendinara, Patrizia. 1992. "On John Scottus's Authorship of the Biblical Glosses." *Studi medievali* no. 33:571-579.
- 88. Leonardi, Claudio. 1977. "Glosse eriugeniane a Marziano Capella in un codice leidense." In *Jean Scot Erigène et l'histoire de la philosophie*, edited by Roques, René, 171-182. Paris: Éditions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique.
- 89. . 1986. "Martianus Capella et Jean Scot : nouvelle présentation d'un vieux problème." In *Jean Scot écrivain*, edited by Allard, Guy-H., 187-207. Paris: Vrin. "Mais je ne veux pas maintenant faire la somme de toutes ces questions érudites, petites ou grandes, mais plutôt me reposer le problème du rapport entre Martianus et l'Érigène, en partant d'une autre base, c'est-à-dire de la signification du De nuptiis dans les premiers siècles du Moyen Age(4): considérer l'épisode de Jean Scot comme un épisode à l'intérieur d'une histoire, et en comprendre le sens seulement ainsi.

Il est vrai que, durant les trente dernières années, le *De Nuptiis Philologiae et Mercurii* de Martianus a suscité l'intérêt des chercheurs, mais on ne peut pas dire que, confrontés à cette œuvre difficile, ils aient trouvé une clef d'interprétation sûre et unanime ; et l'on ne peut pas dire non plus que les étapes de son extraordinaire succès, tout au long du Moyen Age et jusqu'à la Renaissance, aient été dégagées et analysées." (pp. 187-188)

- "L'Erigène est bien conscient du fait que le monde de Martianus est éloigné et différent du sien, et il lui est facile de noter que toute la mythologie du *De nuptiis*, toute l'*Einkleidung* de l'œuvre, n'est autre que *poeticum deliramentum*(65). Mais il n'y a pas seulement cet aspect dans son commentaire: « Martianus quippe Platonicus»(66) est aussi l'auteur antique qui transmet l'idée de l'*anima mundi*, « ex qua spéciales animae... in singulas mundani corporis partes... procedunt(67)» («de laquelle dérivent les âmes particulières dans les diverses parties du corps humain»). Les gloses sur Martianus de l'Érigène sont donc le témoignage de sa confrontation avec le passé : il repousse le passé et en même temps il en assume le problème, il l'érige en preuve de sa propre autoconscience intellectuelle, à l'école et dans la vie(68). (pp. 202-203)
- (4) Cette histoire n'a pas été écrite ; on peut voir, pour le moment, des introductions à cette histoire ou des chapitres plus ou moins provisoires ; cf. entre autres C. Leonardi, «I codici di Marziano Capella», dans *Aevum*, 33 (1959), p. 443-489; W.H. Stahl R. Johnson, *Martianus Capella and the Seven Liberal Arts*, 1, New York-London, 1971, p. 55-72 et passim.
- (65) Iohannis Scotti, *Annotationes in Marcianum*, ed. C. Lutz, Cambridge, Mass. 1939, p. 17 (1. 34).
- (66) *Ibidem*, p. 10 (ligne 19-22).
- (67) *Ibidem*, p. 10(1.35).
- 90. Liebeschütz, Hans. 1960. "Zur Geschichte der Erklärung des Martianus Capella bei Eriugena." *Philologus.Zeitschrift für die Klassische Altertum* no. 104:127-137.

- 91. ——. 1973. "The Place of Martianus *Glossae* in the Development of Eriugena's Thought." In *The Mind of Eriugena*, edited by O'Meara, John Joseph and Bieler, Ludwig, 49-58. Dublin: Irish University Press.
  - "This paper deals with work Eriugena did as a grammarian. It is considered here as a preparatory stage in the growth of the theory by which he tried to understand man and world in a systematic way. In doing so, we shall try to argue that even in this beginning some flexibility of thought and expression and even some development can be traced. These questions must be seen against the problem which the historical phenomenon 'Eriugena' presents to us. There is a considerable anachronistic element in his appearance: he became the first philosopher of the medieval world in a cultural environment which did not seem to favour the rise of systematic thought. 'The owl of Minerva only starts its flight at dusk.' [\*\*]

Moreover we know since Jacquin's paper of 1907 [\*] on *De praedestinatione* that Eriugena's thought went through several phases. The topic of the Martianus glossae underlines the fact that Eriugena started as a grammarian at the court of Charles the Bald and forces us to face his link with Carolingian civilization. It is obvious that the great importance of royal patronage, which lasted throughout his career and has in this form not many parallels in the history of the following centuries of the Middle Ages, was a factor in shaping his mental attitude. Moreover I shall try to show that his original task as grammaticus had also some influence on his later work." (p. 49)

- [\*] M. Jacquin, "Le néo-platonisme de Jean Scot", in *Revue de sciences philosophiques et théologiques*, I (1907), pp. 674-685. [\*\*] G. W. F: Hegel, *Philosophy of Right*, (1820), Preface.
- 92. Limberger, Veronika. 2015. *Eriugenas Hypertheologie*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- 93. Lo Presti, Maria Gabriella. 1990. "La dialettica come "diffiniendi disciplina" nel I libro del De divisione naturae di Giovanni Scoto Eriugena." In Knowledge and the Sciences in Medieval Philosophy. Proceedings of the Eighth International Congress of Medieval Philosophy (S.I.E.P.M.) Helsinki 24-29 August 1987. Vol. II, edited by Knuuttila, Simo, Asztalos, Monika, Tyorinoja, Reijno and Ebbesen, Sten, 558-564. Helsinki.
- 94. Lucentini, Paolo. 1976. "La nuova edizione del "Periphyseon" dell'Eriugena." *Studi Medievali* no. 17:393-414.

  "The 'new' edition referred to is the Sheldon-Williams edition of Books I and II for
  - The 'new' edition referred to is the Sheldon-Williams edition of Books I and II for the Dublin Institute for Advanced Studies. This author reports on the manuscript tradition established in the early decades of this century through the studies of Traube, Rand and Cappuyns and offers some critical suggestions in relation to the completion of the Sheldon-Williams edition interrupted by his death in October 1973. He refers to some inexactitudes in the references to sources, in the description of manuscripts in the Introduction to the edition, as well as in the conclusions on the question of text transmission and of the Eriugenian autograph (which continues to be an open question). He finds that the editor does not succeed in his goal of presenting Eriugena's final text." (Brennan, p. 92).
- 95. . 1977. "La "Clavis physicae" di Honorius Augustodunensis e la tradizione eriugeniana nel secolo XII." In *Jean Scot Erigène et l'histoire de la philosophie*, edited by Roques, René. Paris: Éditions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique.
- 96. . 1979. "Le thème de l'homme-microcosme dans la patristique grecque et chez Jean Scot Érigène." *Diotima* no. 7:111-115.
- 97. ——. 1980. *Platonismo medievale. Contributi per la storia dell'eriugenismo*. Firenze: La Nuova Italia.
- 98. Luhtala, Anneli. 1993. "Syntax and Dialectic in Carolingian Commentaries on Priscian's *Institutiones grammaticae*." *Historiographia Linguistica* no. 20:145-191. Also published in: Vivien Law (ed.), *History of Linguistic Thought in the Early Middle Ages*, Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1993.

99.

-. 1996. "Grammar and Dialectic: A Topical Issue in the Ninth Century." In Iohannes Scottus Eriugena. The Bible and Hermeneutics, edited by Riel, Gerd van, Steel, Carlos and McEvoy, James, 279-301. Leuven: Leuven University Press. "A new grammatical work, a sophisticated Priscian commentary from the ninth century, has recently been discovered. It is the only full Priscianus maior commentary from the Carolingian period, during which Priscian's massive *Institutiones grammaticae* was studied mainly through glossing and excerpting. This commentary has been tentatively attributed to Eriugena(1). In this paper I will discuss the way in which this text was used by Eriugena's contemporaries and by the immediately following generations of grammarians. It seems as if this sophisticated commentary as a whole has been practically unknown in the ninth and tenth centuries. The viewpoint that this commentary was not used by the Carolingians also finds support in the fact that it has survived only in one eleventhcentury copy, Barcelona, Archivo de la corona de Aragon, MS Ripoil 59. However, certain parts of it became standard teaching material in Carolingian schools, as is attested by anonymous glosses to Priscian's *Institutiones grammaticae*. These glosses deal with the nature and status of grammar as a liberal art." (p. 279)

"The Septem periochae formula, etymologies concerning Priscian's name as well as various introductory material —that is what the sophisticated *In Priscianum* commentary seems to have contributed to Carolingian teaching. The influence is on a practical and elementary level. Only one Carolingian teacher seems to have used the text because of its grammatical content. Paradoxically, the exhortation to employ the dialectician's method to grammatical study was copied from one codex to another but the text itself, a prime example of the application of such a method, was not studied by the Carolingians. But one should not underestimate the importance of the teaching material that we have been examining. It deals with the highly topical issue of the nature and status of grammar in the scheme of the seven liberal arts and the disciplinary boundaries between the arts of the *triuium*. Such elementary teaching material served to integrate into Carolingian teaching the novel idea of the assimilation of the study of the arts of the *triuium*. It bears repeating just how radical a change was being introduced into the educational system, which had previously leaned on the differentiation of the various arts of discourse. But the task that Alcuin was proposing —to compare and synthesize the various aspects of language study— was by no means an easy one. He did not seem to know himself how to go about synthesizing the various methods.

The author of the new Priscian commentary knew better. He tackled Priscian's doctrine in a scholarly fashion scrutinizing its philosophical foundation with a keen eye on its inconsistencies and parallelisms with Peripatetic dialectic. It is a prime example of the new philosophical orientation that the study of grammar took in the ninth century. Though there was not likely to be a large audience for this highly theoretical treatise, this method did bear some fruit in the Carolingian period and came to flourish a couple of centuries later. The Carolingian period is one in which diverse experimentation was being conducted but no one continuous accumulating tradition of philosophical grammar established itself. By the end of the eleventh century we have signs of a more solid tradition in the so called Glosule commentaries. Then there was no longer need to assert that the grammarian should discuss the uox in his grammar. But it was soon time to rethink the disciplinary boundaries for grammar and dialectic —a topical issue at the time of William of Conches and Petrus Helias." (pp. 295-296)

(1) For the attribution of this Priscian commentary to Eriugena, see P.E. Dutton - A. Luhtala, *Eriugena in Priscianum*, in *Mediaeval Studies*, 56 (1994), 151-161 and P.E. Dutton, *Evidence that Dubthach's Priscian Codex Once Belonged to Eriugena*, in H.J. Westra (ed.), *From Athens to Chartres. Neoplatonism and Medieval Thought. Studies in Honour of Édouard Jeauneau*, Leiden (E.J. Brill), 1992, 15-45. This commentary has survived in one eleventh-century manuscript of Catalan provenance, Barcelona, Archivo de la Corona de Aragon, Ripoll 59, fols. 257v-

288v. For this manuscript, see M. Passalacqua, *I Codici di Prisciano* (Sussidi eruditi, 19), Roma (Edizioni di storia e letteratura), 1978, 10-11.

- 100. ——. 2000. "Glosses based on Eriugena's Priscian commentary." *Miscellanea Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae* no. 7:199-213.
- 101. ——. 2002. "Time and the Substantival Verb in Eriugena." In *History and Eschatology in John Scottus Eriugena and His Time*, edited by McEvoy, James and Dunne, Michael, 77-87. Leuven: Leuven University Press.

  "In the Early Middle Ages efforts were made to create a thoroughly Christian art of grammar. The most famous representative of Christian grammar is Smaragdus (ca 805), who introduced approximately 750 biblical examples into his grammar. He also approached the grammatical text as if it were divinely inspired: it had a deeper meaning, comparable to the figurative sense of the sacred text."

  (...)

"Another major influence on medieval grammar came from dialectic which began to penetrate the grammatical method in the Carolingian Renaissance. The interaction between grammar and dialectic goes back to the initiative of Alcuin who encouraged the use of the dialectical method even in doctrinal issues. Dialectic was applied to doctrinal issues most notably by Eriugena in the first Book of the *Periphyseon* which is devoted to a discussion of the applicability of the Aristotelian categories to divine issues. Eriugena is probably also the author of a newly discovered grammatical commentary which makes heavy use of the dialectical method. It is the first systematic Priscian commentary preserved from the Middle Ages, and simultaneously the most remarkable achievement Ages(1). Religious issues do not generally figure in this text at all; thus, the main linguistic theme of the Periphyseon, the inapplicability of the categories to God, is absent from it. However, there is one context which invites comparison with Eriugena's main linguistic theme, namely the discussion of the substantival verb, which is the topic of this article. The substantival verb is compared with the Divine Nature, which although permanent and timeless — is nevertheless said somehow to move in a similar way to our temporality. In the same way, the substantival verb signifies permanence, and yet expresses temporality by analogy with other verbs."

"The term substantival verb, *verbum substantivum*, occurs among the ancient authors only in Priscian's *Institutiones grammaticae*. Priscian also mentions its Greek equivalent, ρήμα ύπαρχτικόν(3), which he has probably adopted from his principal Greek source, Apollonius Dyscolus (2nd century A.D.), as he did his doctrine concerning the substantival verb in general." (pp. 77-78)

"Conclusion

Throughout his works, Eriugena was concerned with finding parallels between linguistic phenomena and the Divine Nature. Priscian offers a highly stimulating analysis of the twofold nature of the substantival verb, which was elaborated in Eriugena's commentary on Priscian. It was moreover exploited in Eriugena's two late works. Although similar themes occupy him even at the time of De divina praedestinatione and the Periphyseon, he never refers to Priscian's view of the atemporal meaning of the verb esse in these works. This suggests to me that he might not have known Priscian's analysis of the substantival verb at this time. The Periphyseon shows some knowledge of the Institutiones granunaticae2i, but it is worth asking whether Eriugena did the majority of work on his Priscian commentary only late in his career." (p. 87)

- (1) P.E. Dutton A. Luhtala, "Eriugena in Priscianum", in *Mediaeval Studies*, 56 (1994), 151-161.
- (3) Priscianus, *Institutiones grammaticae*, in H. Keil (ed.), Grammatici latini (= GL), Leipzig (Teubner), 1855-80, II, 414.14.
- 102. ——. 2003. "A Priscian Commentary Attributed to Eriugena." In *History of Linguistics 1999. Selected papers frm the Eighth International Conference on the*

History of the Language Science, 14-19 September 1999, Fontenay-St. Cloud, edited by Auroux, Sylvain, 19-30. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

"The fact that Alcuin's revival of scholarship also involved the use of logic in the study of grammar has received attention from scholars only recently (Vineis 1988; Law 1992; Luhtala 1993). This method, which came to be applied primarily to Priscian's massive *Institutiones grammaticae* (launched into circulation probably by Alcuin himself), was applied highly competently by Eriugena in a text which has only recently been attributed to him (Dutton-Luhtala 1994). This text, which survives in a single eleventh century

manuscript of Catalan provenance (Barcelona, Archivo de la Corona d'Aragón, Ripoll 59, fols. 257v-288v), is the first systematic Priscian commentary preserved to us from the Middle Ages (see Luhtala 2000a, 2000b). It covers the first sixteen books of Priscian's work, on the eight parts of speech, but its author also shows a knowledge of Priscian's syntactic doctrine, which is contained in the last two books, seventeen and eighteen." (p. 20)

(...)

"I have thus given a brief overview of the philosophical interests of the Priscian commentary attributed to Eriugena. Although it is premature to try to assess Eriugena's philosophy in this text as a whole, we are permitted to draw a couple of conclusions. Firstly, Eriugena has interpreted every occurrence of the term accidit as a philosophical term. It means that the categories are now applied even to the discussion on sound and letter because they have accidents; Priscian uses this vocabulary only as pertaining to the description of the noun and the pronoun. It also suggests that Eriugena regarded Priscian's work as a source for philosophy, in which every philosophical term was taken seriously. Philosophical ends occasionally even outweigh the grammatical ones. This is the case when Eriugena chooses to support a somewhat unusual view such that the pronoun can be substituted for the nomina generalia. This point seems to have little relevance for grammar. It rather seems to be the case that the author uses the grammatical text as a point of departure to argue a philosophical (or ultimately theological) case that is important to him, by equating the individuals with the species. Here and elsewhere, this text exhibits philosophical tendencies comparable to those in the Periphyseon."

References

(p. 28)

Dutton, Paul E., Anneli Luhtala. 1994. "Eriugena in Priscianum". *Mediaeval Studies* 56:153–163.

Law, Vivien. 1992. "Carolingian Grammarians and Theoretical Innovation". *Diversions of Galway: Papers from the Fifth International Conference on the History of Linguistics*, ed. by Anders Ahlqvist et al, 27–38. Amsterdam & Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

Luhtala, Anneli. 1993. "Syntax and Dialectic in Carolingian commentaries on Priscian's Institutiones grammaticae". *Historiographia Linguistica* 20:1.151–197. Luhtala, Anneli. 2000a. "Glosses Based on Eriugena's Priscian Commentary". *Miscellanea Bibliothecae Apostolicae Vaticanae* VII, 179–213.

Luhtala, Anneli. 2000b. "Early Medieval Commentary on Priscian's Institutiones grammaticae". *Cahiers de l'institut du Moyen Âge Grecque et Latine* 71, 115–188. Vineis, Edoardo. 1988. "Grammatica e filosofia del linguaggio in Alcuino". Studi e Saggi Linguistici 28:403–429.

- 103. ——. 2012. "Eriugena's Commentary on Priscian's Definitions of the Noun and the Verb." In *Arts du langage et théologie aux confins des XIe/XIIe siécles. Texts, maîtres, débats*, edited by Rosier, Irène, 583-601. Turnhout: Brepols.
- 104. Marenbon, John. 1980. "John Scottus and the *Categoriae Decem*." In *Eriugena: Studien zu seinen Quellen*, edited by Beierwaltes, Werner, 116-134. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.
  - Reprinted in: John Marenbon, Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2000, Essay V.

- 105. . 1980. "A Florilegium from the Periphyseon." *Recherches de Théologie Ancienne et Médiévale* no. 47:271-277.
- 106. ——. 1981. From the School of Alcuin to the School of Auxerre. Logic, theology and philosophy in the early Middle Ages. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- 107. ——. 1981. "Wulfad, Charles the Bald and John Scottus Eriugena." In *Charles the Bald: Court and Kingdom. Papers based on a colloquium held in London in April 1979*, edited by Gibson, Margaret T. and Nelson, Janet Laughland, 375-383. Oxford: British Archaeological Reports.

  Reprinted in: John Marenbon, *Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2000, Essay VI.
- 108. ——. 1983. Early Medieval Philosophy (480-1150). An Introduction. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

  See in particular Chapters 6 and 7 (pp. 53-78).
- 109. ——. 1990. "John Scottus and Carolingian Theology: From the *De Praedestinatione*, its Background and its Critics, to the *Periphyseon*." In *Charles the Bald: Court and Kingdom*, edited by Gibson, Margaret T. and Nelson, Janet Laughland, 303-325. Aldershot: Variorum.

  Reprinted in: John Marenbon, *Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2000, Essay VII.
- 110. ——. 1993. "Carolingian Thought." In *Carolingian Culture: Emulation and Innovation*, edited by McKitterick, Rosamond, 171-192. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

  Reprinted in: John Marenbon, *Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2000, Essay III.
- 111. ——. 2000. Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West. Aldershot: Ashgate.

  Essays related to Eriugena: III. Carolingian Thought; IV. Alcuin, the Council of Frankfort and the Beginnings of Medieval Philosophy; V. John Scottus and the Categoriae Decem; VI. Wulfad, Charles the Bald and John Scottus Eriugena; VII. John Scottus and Carolingian Theology: From the De Praedestinatione, its Background and its Critics, to the Periphyseon.
- 112. ——. 2005. "Les *Catégories* au début du Moyen Âge." In *Les Catégories et leur histoire*, edited by Bruun, Otto and Corti, Lorenzo, 223-244. Paris: Vrin.
- 113. ——. 2012. "Alcuin, the Council of Frankfort and the Beginnings of Medieval Philosophy." In *Das Frankfurter Konzil von 794. Kristallisationspunkt karolingischer Kultur*, edited by Rainer, Berndt, 603-615. Mainz: Selbstverlag der Gesellschaft für Mittelrheinische Kirchengeschichte.

  Reprinted in: John Marenbon, *Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2000, Essay IV.
- 114. Marler, Jack C. 1994. "Dialectical Use of Authority in the *Periphyseon*." In *Eriugena East and West*, edited by McGinn, Bernard and Otten, Willemien, 95-114. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
- 115. ——. 2004. "Ammonius and Eriugena: on Matter and Predication." In *Erkenntnis und Wissenschaft. Probleme der Epistemologie in der Philosophie des Mittelalters* = *Knowledge and science. Problems of epistemology in medieval philosophy*, edited by Lutz-Bachmann, Matthias, Fidora, Alexander and Antolic, Pia. Berlin: Akademie Verlag.
- 116. Martello, Concetto. 1984. "Sul platonismo di Giovanni Scoto. Tendenze storiografiche negli studi sulle fonti eriugeniane." In *Momenti e problemi di storia del platonismo*, 85-107. Catania: CUECM.
- 117. . 1986. Simbolismo e Neoplatonismo in Giovanni Scoto Eriugena. Catania: CUECM.

- 118. . 1990. Analogia e Fisica in Giovanni Scoto. Catania: CUECM.
- 119. ——. 2002. "Alle origini del lessico filosofico latino: hypostasis/substantia in Giovanni Scoto." In Hyparxis e Hypostasis nel neoplatonismo. Atti del I Colloquio Internazionale del Centro di Ricerca sul neoplatonismo (Catania, 1-3 Ottobre 1992), edited by Romano, Francesco and Taormina, Daniela Patrizia, 169-184. Firenze: Olschki.
- 120. 2002. "Riflessi del *Parmenide* in Giovanni Eriugena." In *Il Parmenide di Platone e la sua tradizione. Atti del Terzo Colloquio internazionale del Centro di ricerca sul neoplatonismo*, edited by Barbanti, Maria and Romano, Francesco, 371-393. Catania: CUECM.
- Martin, Francis X., and Richmond, John A., eds. 1991. From Augustine to Eriugena: Essays on Neoplatonism and Christianity in Honor of John O'Meara. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.
  The following essays are on Eriugena:
  G.-H. Allard: Jean Scot et l'ordinateur: le traitement syntaxique du "Periphyseon" 1-11; A. H. Armstrong: Apophatic-Kataphatic tensions in religious thought from the Third to the Sixth century A.D.: a background for Augustine and Eriugena 12; W. Beierwaltes: Eriugenas Faszination 22-41; M. Herren: Johannes Scottus Poeta 92-106; E: Jeauneau: Vox spiritualis Aquilae: Quelques épis oubliées 107-116; G. Madec: Theologia: note augustino-èrigénienne 11-125.
- Mathon, Gérard. 1955. "Le commentaire du Pseudo-Érigène sur la *Consolatio philosophiae* de Boèce." *Recherches de Théologie Ancienne et Médiévale* no. 22:213-257.
- 123. . 1960. "Jean Scot Érigène, Chalcidius et le problème de l'âme universelle." In L'homme et son destin d'après les penseurs du moyen âge. Actes du premier Congrès international de philosophie médiévale, Louvain-Bruxelles, 28 août-4 septembre 1958, 361-375. Louvain: Nauwelaerts.
- 124. . 1964. L'anthropologie chrétienne en Occident de saint Augustin à Jean Scot Érigène. Recherches sur le sort des thèses de l'anthropologie augustinienne durant le haut moyen âge, Lille.

  Thèse inédite, Université Catholique de Lille, Faculté de théologie.

  Trois volumes: I. L'héritage et sa transmission; II. Terminos Patrum ne transgrediaris; III. Références e notes annexes.
- 125. . 1969. "Les formes et la signification de la pédagogie des arts libéraux au milieu du IXe siècle dans l'enseignement palatin de Jean Scot Erigène." In *Arts liberaux et philosophie au Moyen Age. Actes du IVe Congrès International de Philosophie Médiévale, Montréal, 27/8 2/9 1967*, 47-64. Paris: Vrin.
- In Begriff und Metapher. Sprachform des Denkens bei Eriugena, edited by Beierwaltes, Werner, 149-167. Heidelberg: Carl Winter.

  "The theme of light in the writings of Eriugena is a vast one, representing as it does a vitally important strand of his dialectic. To think it away, if the effort could be made, would be to destroy not a part only, but in a way the whole of his thought; very much would have to be re-cast, re-thought or left unspoken, if the concepts clustering around light and developed in the context of light were to be omitted, or the symbol of light suppressed."

"An entire study could be devoted to each one of the strands that together make up the light-thematic of Eriugena. One could study the phenomena of sight, for instance the concept of the visual ray and the long history of its transmission, taking in at the same time colour and form, reconstructing the sources which were at the disposal of Eriugena and assessing the use which he made of them. Fire has proved to be a rich and rewarding area of investigation in Eriugena, as Edouard Jeauneau has ably demonstrated in his study of what he rightly calls 'la métaphysique du

feu'(2). The sun, taken together with (or even without) the other planets, in its relationship to its origin (fire) and its products (light and heat), is of particular interest to Eriugena (as it had been to Plato, Philo, Plotinus, Basil, Ambrose and Augustine before him), and has an almost transcendent importance in Eriugena's reflections on the physical universe, of which the sun is the 'central' body. The close connection between light and life, and the complementary symbolism of sight and object of sight, on the one hand, and hearing and the word, on the other (developed, for example, in the Homily') is also of great interest, as is the invocation of the authority of Scripture, so regularly made with regard to light and related subjects in *Periphyseon* and *Expositiones*: no systematic study has as yet been made of the employment of the dozen or so main scriptural texts which Eriugena expounds in connection with light and the symbolism of light and sight(3).

Since it would be unsatisfactory, and indeed next to impossible to give a digest of all these themes, I have adopted the following strategy, for simplicity as much as for hermeneutical purposes. I choose two broad themes within the dialectic of Eriugena, viz the sun as the chief source of light in the universe, and sight or vision. In a first approach, each of these is discussed 'physically' (or physiologically), in order to lay bare the basic concepts and their sources. A second approach addresses itself to the metaphors raised by Eriugena on the base of the concepts as outlined, once again with an eye being kept to his sources. A third demarche attempts to study conjointly the role of the concepts and metaphors within the dialectic, in order to show the specific contribution of both to the dialectical discourse so thoroughly characteristic of Eriugena's personal thought." (pp. 149-150)

- (2) Jeauneau, Ed., 'Jean Scot et la métaphysique du feu', in the same writer's volume of collected studies, *Etudes erigéniennes*, Paris 1987, pp. 299-319.
- (3) Among the favourite scriptural references to light of Eriugena are the following: *Gen* 1.3: Dixitque Deus: Fiat lux. Et facta est lux. *Gen* 1.4: vidit Deus lucem quod esset bona et divisit lucem a tenebris. *Jn* 1.5: Deus lux est, tenebrae in eo non sunt ullae. *I Tim* 6.16: qui solus habet immortalitatem, et lucem inhabitat inaccessibilem: quern nullus homo videt, sed nec videre potest. *Ps* 109.3: Ex utero ante luciferum genui te. To these may be added the Transfiguration narrative in the Synoptic Gospels: *Matt* 17.1-8; *Mk* 9.1-9; *Lk* 9.28-36.
- 127. ——. 1992. "Neoplatonism and Christianity: Influence, Syncretism or Discernment?" In *The Relationship between Neoplatonism and Christianity*, edited by Finan, Thomas and Twomey, Vincent, 155-170. Dublin: Four Court Press.
- 128. ——. 1994. "Biblical and Platonic Measure in John Scottus Eriugena." In *Eriugena East and West*, edited by McGinn, Bernard and Otten, Willemien, 153-178. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
- 129. ——. 1999. "Thomas Gallus, Abbas Vercellensis, and the commentary on the *De Mystica Theologia* ascribed to Iohannes Scottus Eriugena, with a concluding note on the second Latin reception of the Pseudo-Dionysius (1230-1250)." In *Traditions of Platonism: Essays in Honour of John Dillon*, edited by Cleary, John J., 389-406. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- 130. McGee, J. David. 1988. "Reflections of The Thought of John Scotus Erigena in some Carolingian and Ottonian Illuminations." *Mediaevistik* no. 1:125-143.
- 131. McGinn, Bernard. 1977. "The Negative Element in the Anthropology of John the Scot." In *Jean Scot Erigène et l'histoire de la philosophie*, edited by Roques, René, 315-326. Paris: Éditions du Centre national de la recherche scientifique.
- 132. ——. 1995. "The Entry of Dialectical Mysticism." In *The Growth of Mysticism. Vol. II. The Presence of God: A History of Western Christian Mysticism*, 80-118. London: SCM Press.

Part I: Early Medieval Mysticism. Chapter 3: The Entry of Dialectical Mysticism: John Scotts Eriugena.

"Foundations of Erlugenian Mysticism

The mystical theory of John Scottus Eriugena is inseparable from the whole philosophical-theological system presented in Periphyseon and underlying his commentaries on John's Gospel and Dionysius's *Celestial Hierarchy*. Hence it will be necessary to give a brief presentation of the foundational themes of his thought concerning *processio*, the self-manifestation of God, before turning to the more directly mystical themes mostly (but not solely) found in his treatment of *reditus*. I shall do so under three headings taken from his own words, the first two dealing primarily with *processio*, the third with *reditus*: (1) *Deus est superessentialis* (P 1 [460C]) the dialectical view of God; (2) *Omnia lumina sunt* (EI 1.1 [3.76-77] creation as the illuminating divine self-manifestation; (3) *Donec veniamus in unum* (EI 8.2 |133.550-1]) union with God through deifying contemplation." (pp. 97-98) (...)

"What, then, does the Eriugenian reditus mean? What will change? What will the future state be like? John the Scot was always realistic enough to know what could be said and what could not be said about this final adunatio. The ultimate differentiating union will be a change in the awareness of all humanity. First, humanity will be absorbed back into the elements in death; then, in the general resurrection humankind will be brought to a state in which there will be no more divisions, with sexual differentiation being the first to go. Finally, after it has progressed through all the stages of sublimating unification, humanity will reach the final differentiation in unity of the cosmic Christ The Word stands at the beginning and end. But the end is different from the beginning, and it is perhaps in this aspect of his thought that John Scottus Eriugena proves himself not just a clever synthesizer of East and West, but one of the creative minds of the Christian tradition." (p. 117).

- 133. ——. 2002. "Eriugena Confronts the End. Reflections on Johannes Scottus's Place in Carolingian Eschatology." In *History and Eschatology in John Scottus Eriugena and his Time*, edited by McEvoy, James and Dunne, Michael, 3-29. Leuven: Leuven University Press.
- 134. ——. 2014. "Exegesis as Metaphysics: Eriugena and Eckhart on Reading Genesis 1-3." In Eriugena and Creation. Proceedings of the Eleventh International Conference on Eriugenian Studies, held in honor of Edouard Jeauneau, Chicago, November 9-12, 2011, edited by Otten, Willemien and Allen, Michael I., 463-499. Turnhout: Brepols.